

Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries
Attention: Ms. Tsepang Makholela
Private Bag X447
Pretoria
0001
South Africa

9 October 2023

Dear Dr. Tsepang Makholela,

'Draft Policy Position on the Conservation and Sustainable use of Elephant, Lion, Leopard and Rhinoceros'

Please find attached a submission as requested in Government Notice 3889 of 2023 "Draft Policy Position on the Conservation and Sustainable use of Elephant, Lion, Leopard and Rhinoceros" ("Policy Position") as notified in Government Gazette, No. 49322, Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment (DFFE), dated 19 September 2023.

Please find International Wildlife Bond's (IWB's) submission here within (submitted by e-mail to policyposition@DFFE.gov.za).

Yours sincerely,

Stephen Alan Wiggins

Founder of International Wildlife Bond (IWB) Registered Charity No. 1164833

E: stephenawiggins@iwbond.org

Web: https://iwbond.org/



'<u>Draft Policy Position on the Conservation and Sustainable use of Elephant, Lion, Leopard and Rhinoceros'</u>

Table of Contents

1	Inti	roduc	tion		
	1.1	Cap	tive Lions	3	
	1.2	Сар	tive Rhinoceros	3	
	1.3	Leo	pard	4	
	1.4	Inte	rnational Trade in the Live Specimens of the Five Species	5	
	1.5	Rhir	noceros	6	
	1.5	.1	International Commercial Trade in Rhinoceros Horn	6	
	1.5	.2	Rhinoceros Trophy Hunting	9	
	1.6	Elep	phant	10	
1.6		.1	International Commercial Trade in Elephant Ivory	10	
	1.6	.2	Elephant Trophy Hunting	10	
2 Conclusions		ons	12		
3	Bib	liogra	phy	14	



1 Introduction

The Policy Position proposals to correct unsustainable practices and promote conservation are welcome. However, the implied assumption within the Policy Position that sustainable use of the five species is somehow compatible by default with any reasonable definition of conservation is not shared.

1.1 Captive Lions

The Policy Position ((1), page 5) "to end the captive keeping of lions for commercial purposes and close captive lion facilities, put a halt to the intensive breeding of lion in controlled environments, and end the commercial exploitation of captive and captive-bred lion" is long-overdue and welcomed (("IWB's HLP Submission," para 9.2 "Captive Lion Breeding (CLB) – Calls for Closure").

It is understood that "The minister has put in place a lion advisory panel which is attempting to assess the captive lion population and looking into voluntary exit plans for breeders" ("Government opens public comments on policy to end captive lion breeding," Daily Maverick, 26 September 2023). The recommendations of the advisory panel are awaited.

1.2 Captive Rhinoceros

The Policy Position ((2), page 5) "to phase out the domestication and intensification of management of rhinoceros" is welcomed.

The news ("Hume's herd of 2,000 African rhinos get a last-minute 'lifeline' in major purchase and rewilding project," Daily Maverick, 4 September 2023) that John Hume's herd of some 2,000 rhinoceros are now in the safe hands of African Parks with plans for rewilding/conservation of them is great news. These rhinoceros are no longer a speculative commodity based upon a return on investment from the 'hope' of a bonanza resulting from a legal international trade in rhino horn being sanctioned by CITES. A legal rhino horn trade has risks for species conservation/survival. Legitimising demand could wipe out the species with uncontrollable rhino poaching resulting from a clamour to cash in. There is no credible



science that says reinstating an international trade rhino horn is without risk to the species – ref para 1.5.1 International Commercial Trade in Rhinoceros Horn.

1.3 Leopard

The Policy Position ((3), page 5) "to enhance the conservation....of leopard" is welcome. However, the proposed "sustainable use" of leopard is not welcome when it encompasses "evidence-based sustainable harvesting of leopard" (Policy Position, 4. page 12) – where such evidence has been lacking but still the "harvesting" of leopards has been perpetuated since 2018 after a brief hiatus:

The trophy hunting of leopards clearly does contribute to the long-term decline of leopards in the wild and disrupts the genetic integrity of the leopard population (Naude et al. 2020) – the evidence-base does not support leopard trophy hunting;

High rates of trophy hunting have caused population declines in many sepecies, including African leopards (<u>Packer et al. 2009</u>, <u>Balme et al. 2009</u>, <u>Swanepoel et al. 2014</u>, <u>Naude et al. 2020</u>), reference "<u>IWB's HLP Submission</u>," para 10.2 – "Leopard Trophy Hunting and Leopard Skins"

The 2022 <u>Draft Policy Position perpetuated the trophy hunting of leopards</u> - suggesting leopard trophy hunting should continue to be promoted within the draft policy because leopards "are an important component of international hunting packages, making such packages internationally competitive" – the Policy Position (para 6.3, page 11) reiterates "Leopards are an important component of international hunting packages, making such packages internationally competitive." These are commercial arguments, not ones based on conservation:

Trophy hunting's claimed pursuit of species' conservation regardless of an individual animal's suffering and/or sentience as a trophy is clearly incompatible with the Draft White Paper's definitions and goals - "Consultation on Conservation and Sustainable Use - South Africa," IWB, 31 August 2022

This latest iteration of the Policy Position and the continued promotion of sustainable utilisation of leopards (for example) as legitimate trophy hunting targets (despite evidence it



harms the species' conservation) does not address the lack of altruistic conservation imperatives of the trophy hunting industry.

Leopard trophy hunting has been manipulated in the past to perpetuate leopard persecution ("<u>IWB's HLP Submission</u>," para 10.2 "Leopard Trophy Hunting and Leopard Skins"):

In January 2016 the Republic of South Africa, Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA) set a zero-leopard hunting quota across all provinces (then extended the zero quota through 2017). The DEA accepted the negative non-detrimental finding (meaning it found hunting to have a detrimental effect). However since 2018, a leopard hunting quota has been re-established within South Africa, though in reality the leopard trophy hunting persecution (Friedmann et al. 2008) never stops even when there is a moratorium on trophy hunting, with many leopards designated as 'problem animals' so a permit could be obtained (and sold on) for trophy hunting purposes.

Recent leopard declines in Africa are also related to prey declines (medium and large-sized wild herbivores) and the unsustainable and increasingly commercialized bushmeat trade, leading to collapses in prey populations across large parts of savanna Africa (<u>Lindsey et al. 2013</u>), plus the unregulated attrition to supply skins to unregulated 'muti' markets.

Therefore, any suggestion that South Africa can now espouse 'evidence-based leopard hunting quotas' when there has been "no rigorous estimate for the size of the South African leopard population, nor reliable estimates of leopard population trends at national or provincial level" (HLP Terms of Reference, issued 22 April 2020) does ring hollow – there is a current leopard hunting quota that has no evidence-base, so will there now be a moratorium on leopard trophy hunting re-established?

1.4 International Trade in the Live Specimens of the Five Species

The Policy Position states there is potential for live translocation of the five iconic species.

However, international trade in white rhinoceros, black rhinoceros, lions, leopards and elephants is fraught with potentially corrupt intentions and the Policy Position rightly states that sending "wild animals into captivity [or worse] in other countries has the potential to harm South Africa's reputation as a wildlife destination." One only has to look at the recent



(July 2023) export of captive bred lions from South Africa to Laos under the pretext (CITES permits issued duly noted) that the lions were going to "zoo" (despite no obvious final zoo being the ultimate destination) as evidence of the lax export of wildlife as commodity from South Africa's international trade in live specimens ("<u>EXPORT OF 10 LIVE LIONS FROM SOUTH AFRICA TO THE LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC</u>," EMS Foundation, 10 August 2023). The most likely incentive for this export is the illicit supply to the lion bone trade.

Therefore, the Policy Position (page 13) objective to only export to "range states or other appropriate and acceptable destinations with suitable habitat on the African continent, for reintroduction into the wild" is laudable. However, safeguarding the stated intentions and overseeing what happens to any rhinoceros, lion, leopard or elephant so exported requires a system of checks and balances that has so far eluded such international trade (which has been overwhelmingly driven by commercial incentives to date, not readily identifiable rewilding/conservation imperatives). What will stop any range state from reselling/exporting wildlife supplied in good-faith by South Africa?

1.5 Rhinoceros

1.5.1 International Commercial Trade in Rhinoceros Horn

The quest for an international trade in rhino horn seems to be driven by an ideology of the Republic of South Africa State and a percentage of private speculators seeking to profit from such trade ("IWB's HLP Submission," para 13.13.1). The majority of South Africa's rhino 'pay' (via general tourism mainly) for their existence in reserves, private ownership and parks without resorting to demanding any rhino horn trade:

South Africa's policy of demanding (unprompted by the international CITES community) started in 2014 when the Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs (DEA) issued "*The viability of legalising trade in rhino horn in South Africa*" and presented it to CITES CoP. The policy presented to CITES 2013/14 is embedded in providing income to the State (from the sale of stockpiles) and profits to a handful of speculative rhino breeders that decided (of their own volition) to speculate on the future lifting of the 1997 CITES ban on international trade in rhino horn – not driven by an altruistic conservation imperative.



There is clearly potential incompatibility and risks with the Policy Position (page 4) stated aim "to effectively address rhinoceros poaching and the illegal trade in rhinoceros horn" whilst simultaneously seeking "to reach a point where any potential international commercial trade in rhinoceros horn would contribute to conservation outcomes."

The theory promoted within the Policy Position is that South Africa can promote at some future point a legal international trade in rhino horn by "addressing the five key areas of security (law enforcement), community empowerment, biological management, responsible legislative provisions and effective implementation, and demand management/reduction."

However, legal trade is not a panacea – it can increase negative consequences for species conservation as highlighted below (also reference para 1.6.1, "International Commercial Trade in Elephant Ivory").

1.5.1.1 Legal Trade Does Not Counter Illicit Trade

There is no evidence to support the theory that legal trade deters illegal trade (reference "<u>IWB's HLP Submission</u>," paras 12.5) - legal trade gives illegal trade opportunities to flourish in parallel.

A 2016 United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) report, "<u>World Wildlife Crime</u> <u>Report – Trafficking in protected species</u>" explored policy areas to counter poaching and trafficking, making one clear point that 'legal' commercial trade routes provide opportunities for criminals:

"Case studies show that when illegally traded wildlife is introduced into legal commercial streams, criminals have access to a much larger source of demand than they would have had on the black market alone."

Therefore, reaching the envisioned utopia where a legal international trade in rhino has no negative consequences is highly unlikely – in the meantime, keeping the notion of a legal intentional trade mechanism being a future objective continues to legitimise demand, incentives stockpiling and illicit activity to meet the demand so legitimised.



1.5.1.2 Can A legal Trade in Rhino Horn Meet Demand?

There is no evidence that any captive/wild rhino horn supply mechanism can meet demand (the demand is potentially unbounded/unknown – reference "<u>IWB's HLP Submission</u>," para 11.3.4, "Can Harvested Rhino Horn Meet Demand if Rhino Horn is 'Destigmatised'?").

1.5.1.3 Legal Trade and Demand Reduction

The Policy Position proposes that there is desire for South Africa to one day promote a legal ('sustainable utilisation') trade in rhino horn whilst simultaneously suggesting there will be boundaries imposed on profiting from such a trade by creating a conflicting incentive for "demand management/reduction." This could be described as a dichotomy at best, delusional at worse:

Economic science suggests that Demand Management/Legal Trade is not the answer if demand reduction is the true intent: "Our model indicates that less conventional demand management strategies (such as consumer education, behaviour modification), appear to be more effective strategies in managing rhino horn demand than legalising the trade in rhino horns - "Debunking the myth that a legal trade will solve the rhino crisis: A system dynamics model for market demand," Economic Research Southern Africa (ERSA), D. J. Crooks and J. N. Bilgnault, Journal for Nature Conservation, Elsevier, Pretoria, 2015

1.5.1.4 Economic Incentives Drive 'Sustainable Utilisation' Decisions

In the past, the majority of 'sustainable utilisation' decisions (such as the lion bone trade, or rhino horn trade etc.) have relied purely upon readily quantifiable economic justifications, which are not proven to be compatible with enshrining biodiversity, ecology and conservation:

"As economic benefits are easier to quantify than ecological benefits, there is a tendency to neglect ecological benefits and harms that are far more difficult to quantify, whether in economic/financial terms or in terms of conservation efficiency.



Policy positions based on economic considerations often neglect critical ethical issues such as ecological justice, human rights and human responsibilities. The implication is that a preconceived level of economic benefit justifies (a degree of) ecological harm; especially if that benefit could be used to advance the human development project. If the economic benefit, as perceived by humans, is sufficient, then any ecological harm can be justified, whereas the "value" of maintaining ecological integrity is never stated or used as a counter balance to economic arguments" — World Commission on Environmental Law (WCEL) Ethics Specialist Group (ESG), 2017

"<u>Illich</u>, a prophetic voice, understood that the more we viewed nature as a disposable commodity or a convenient resource, the less we would worry about its degradation" - <u>Nikiforuk 2019</u>

"Many of us seem to have lost all sense of restraint towards animals, an understanding of natural boundaries, a respect for them as beings with needs and wants and a place and purpose of their own. Too often, too casually, we assume that our interest always come first, and if it's profitable or expedient that is all we need to know" - Scully 2011

1.5.2 Rhinoceros Trophy Hunting

The Policy Position states at (5) page 5 "Enhanced conservation and sustainable use of protected wild rhinoceros under private, community, and state ownership."

It can be argued that the 1995 CITES Appendix 1 exemption of South Africa's white rhinoceros for trophy hunting provided a 'legal' mechanism to obtain rhino horn via pseudo hunting (pretending to be trophy hunters) after a 2009 upswing in demand for rhino horn's inclusion in Traditional Medicine (TM) ("IWB's HLP Submission," para 11.6 – "Rhinoceros Trophy Hunting and Poaching"). Therefore, the continued 'sustainable utilisation' of rhinoceros as hunting trophies and/or pseudo hunting loop-hole to obtain 'legal' rhino horn is not necessarily compatible with conservation of the species – demand and satisfying demand drives poaching. How does anyone know the motives for the desire to obtain a rhino hunting trophy – is it just to obtain rhino horn as a tradeable commodity?

"Ten years ago Chinese hunters sought only 18 hunting trophy import permits from CITES officials. By 2017 that figure had soared to 2,142, a rise of nearly 1200%....
Today, China is second only to the US for the total number of 'hunting trophy' imports



of wild animals, having leapfrogged long-established markets such as Germany and Spain" - Gonçalves 2020

1.6 Elephant

1.6.1 International Commercial Trade in Elephant Ivory

There is no evidence to support any return to an international commercial trade in elephant ivory – past releases from ivory stockpiles have driven species decline ("<u>IWB's HLP</u> <u>Submission</u>," para 8.3.1 – "Elephant Ivory Demand Management and Regulatory Failure").

Therefore, it remains questionable if there is any realistic likelihood of 'return on investment' in securing and managing ivory in registered stockpiles. One thing that is clear that previous releases of ivory from stockpiles has not contributed to elephant conservation, but have resulted in the opposite.

There is also the risk that the keeping of such ivory stockpiles gives credence to the hope of further speculative profiteering from ivory somewhere in the future, when that is extremely unlikely. In the absence of any legal releases from registered stockpiles being likely, there is also the potential for unregistered ivory stockpiles to be illicitly horded and illicitly trafficked.

Perhaps the right thing to do is declare an amnesty for illicitly stockpiled ivory to be handed into appropriate authorities and all stockpiles, including State stockpiles destroyed. Kenya has clearly shown global leadership by <u>burning stockpiles of ivory and rhino horn</u> in 2016 – Kenya's president, Uhuru Kenyatta stating at the time:

"The future of the African elephant and rhino is far from secure so long as demand for their products continues to exist"

1.6.2 Elephant Trophy Hunting

The Policy Position states at (6) page 6 "Enhanced conservation and sustainable use of elephants..." As recently demonstrated ("Balule trophy hunt — how not to shoot an elephant," Daily Maverick, 12 September 2023), trophy hunting/'sustainable use' of elephants does not



by default equal recognisable conservation ("IWB's HLP Submission," para 8.1.1., "Elephant trophy hunting in South Africa").

For example, it is questionable that elephants (national assets) moved from the protection of Kruger Park to be 'sustainably utilised' for trophy hunting within Associated Private Nature Reserves (APNR) alongside Kruger Park contributes to conservation - it remains a matter of clear dispute that the movement of elephant from the protection of Kruger Park to be trophy hunted in areas is lawful, and serves any purpose other than to "fund the leisure lifestyles of a group of mainly white landowners with scant benefit to bordering communities" - Pinnock 2020.

A recent open letter ("Conservationists appeal for end to hunting of elephants in private reserves bordering Kruger"," Daily Maverick, 26 September 2023) by Wildlife Animal Protection Forum South Africa (WAPFSA) to Minister (of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment) Barbara Creecy clearly catalogues numerous examples of poorly managed elephant hunts damaging Greater Kruger National Park and South Africa's reputation. These hunts do not make any transparent contribute to local communities but serves wealthy white landowners and the self-gratification of an elite client base that enjoy killing wildlife for pleasure.

The Policy Position proposes that it will correct unsustainable practices and promote conservation. The National Environmental Management Biodiversity Act (NEMBA) entitles the South African government "to make policy decisions in relation to contentious and damaging practices; decisions that are in the public interest, prioritising public opinion and the economic benefits of the public" (WAPFSA, 2023).

So, will the unethical practice of the sports killing of elephants from the protection of Kruger Park be encompassed under the umbrella of the Policy Position's "sustainable use of elephants..." or not?



2 Conclusions

The Policy Position states clearly that captive keeping of lions for commercial purposes is to end and that domestication of rhinoceros for speculative purposes is to be phased out – all most welcome umbrella statements.

However, the Policy Position is disingenuous in terms of continuing to entertain the prospect of re-establishing a legal international trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory — thereby continuing to legitimise domestication of rhino, the stockpiling of rhino horn and obtaining/stockpiling elephant ivory by legal (and no doubt illicit) means in the hope of future financial gain. The pursuit of such international legal trade is not driven by any altruistic conservation imperative. For example, the promise that State funds so derived from a legal international trade from State stockpiles will serve conservation — this has not been borne out in the past:

State income will most likely go into general coffers, regardless of any promises to the contrary (as <u>reported in the misappropriated income from ivory stockpiles in 2008</u>).

The sale of private stockpiles of rhino horn has no proven means to counter illicit trade, or indeed any credible evidence that any captive/wild rhino horn supply mechanism can meet demand stimulated by legitimising demand for rhino horn.

Trophy hunting clearly contradicted the <u>draft White Paper's</u> acknowledgment of animal sentience (enshrined within South Africa, as a signatory to the International World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE), which recognises animals as sentient) and a need to protect an individual animal's well-being ("South Africa's Biodiversity 2022: Consultation on the Draft White Paper on Conservation and Sustainable Use" ("Draft White Paper"), dated 8 July 2022"):

9.4.12. Animal Well-being: The well-being of wild animals must form an integral part of all wildlife-based practices, recognising wild animals are capable of suffering and of experiencing pain, and that sentience requires a higher level of consideration of the impact of actions on the well-being of wild animals.

where;



animal sentience is acknowledged within the Draft White Paper (at para 10.4.3) as being enshrined within South Africa, as a signatory to the International World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE), which recognises animals as sentient.

However, within the 14 June 2023 (Gazette 48785, Notice 3537) "<u>White Paper on Conservation and Sustainable Use of South Africa's Biodiversity</u>" "Animal well-being" has been redefined with no acknowledgement of an animal's sentience or ability to suffer and experience pain:

Animal well-being: The holistic circumstances and conditions of an animal or population of animals which are conducive to their physical, physiological and mental health and quality of life, including their ability to cope with their environment.

A targeted animal's suffering is guaranteed within trophy hunting. Hence why it is suspected the definition of "Animal well-being" for example has been diluted between draft and published White Papers – to support and perpetuate trophy hunting despite animal suffering (even if animal sentience was acknowledged within the <u>draft White Paper</u> (at para 10.4.3) as being enshrined within South Africa, as a signatory to the International World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE)).

It's hard to see how South Africa's reputation can be enhanced by the Policy Position (and complementary published White Paper) continuing to perpetuate trophy hunting whilst watering down definitions that highlight trophy hunting's persecution and inflicted suffering upon targeted animals. Trophy hunting's target animals still suffer and bleed to provide a trophy regardless of diluting of definitions:

Animal suffering is guaranteed within trophy hunting, so pretending to care about the target animal's suffering/well-being and what level is acceptable, could at best be described as disingenuous, but in reality, reflects a lack of empathy in pursuit of the 'trophy' for self-gratification, bordering upon a callous obsession (Beattie, G., 2020).



3 Bibliography

Ahmad, A., 2016 - "The Trophy Hunting Debate – A Case of Ethics," Department of Political Science, University of Delhi, Economic & Political Weekly, Vol 51, Issue No 26 – 27

Animal Rights Africa, Pickover, M., 4 July 2010 - "Hunting in South Africa: A bloody mess," Conservation Action Trust

Annamiticus, 24 July 2014 - "South Africa's Game Industry Insiders Continue to Evade Punishment for Rhino Crimes"

Ashcroft, M., due June 2020 - ""Unfair Game" - An exposé of South Africa's captive-bred lion industry," Biteback Publishing

Bailey, T.N., 1993 – "The African Leopard; Ecology and Behaviour of a Solitary Felid," The Blackburn Press, ISBN-10: 1-932846-11-5

Baker, S.E.; Cain, R.; van Kesteren, F.; Zommers, Z.A.; D'Cruze, N.; Macdonald, D.W., 1 December 2013 – "Rough Trade: Animal Welfare in the Global Wildlife Trade," BioScience, Vol. 63, Issue 12 https://academic.oup.com/bioscience/issue/63/12

Balme, G.; Slotow, R.; Hunter, L., 2009 - "Impact of conservation interventions on the dynamics and persistence of a persecuted leopard (Panthera pardus) population," Biological Conservation:142 Vol 11, p. Pages 2681–2690

Batavia, C.; Nelson, M.P.; Darimont, C.T.; Paquet, P.C.; Ripple, W.J.; Wallach, A.D., 25 April 2018 - "The elephant (head) in the room: A critical look at trophy hunting," – Society for Conservation Biology

Batavia, C.; Bruskotter, J.T.; Darimont, C.T.; Nelson, M.P.; Wallach, A.D.; + 56 signatories, 2019 - "Trophy hunting: Values inform policy." Science

Baylis, K.; Honey-Rosés, J.; Börner, J.; Corbera, E.; Ezzine-de-Blas, D.; Ferraro, P.J.; Lapeyre, R.; Persson, U.M.; Pfaff, A.; Wunder, S., 29 April 2015 - "Mainstreaming Impact Evaluation in Nature Conservation," Conservation Letters, 9, 58-64

Beattie, G., 2020, "Trophy Hunting - A Psychological Perspective," Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group

Bell, C., 21 May 2020 - "Ban all trade in the body parts of rhino and elephant," Leadership for Conservation in Africa (LCA)

Bell, C., 4 June 2020 – "Rhino horn trade - why trade is bad for our wild rhino populations," Africa Geographic

Bilchitz, D. - 2017 - "Exploring the Relationship between the Environmental Right in the South African Constitution and Protection for the Interests of Animals," Exploring the Relationship Between the Environmental Right in the South African Constitution and Protection for the Interests of Animals South African Law Journal

Blood Lions, 2015 - "Blood Lions - Bred for the bullet"

Born Free Foundation, March 2018 - "Cash before conservation"

Born Free Foundation, July 2019, "Trophy Hunting; Busting the myths and exposing the cruelty"

Bouché, P.; Crosmary, W.; Kafando, P.; Doamba, B.; Kidjo, F.C.; Vermeulen, C.; et al., 2016 – "Embargo on Lion Hunting Trophies from West Africa: An Effective Measure or a Threat to Lion Conservation?" PLOS ONE

Brink, Henry; Smith, Robert J.; Skinner, Kirsten; Leader-Williams, Nigel, 2016 – "Sustainability and Long Term-Tenure: Lion Trophy Hunting in Tanzania"

Broom, D.M.; Johnson, K.G., 1993 – "Stress and Animal Welfare"



Carte Blanche, 17 May 2020 - "Cheetah Cheater - The Wildlife Export Trade"

Caro, T.; Young, C.; Cauldwell, A.; Brown, D., 2009 – "Animal breeding systems and big game hunting: Models and application," Biological Conservation

Campaign Against Canned Hunting (UK) and SPOTS, Netherlands, August 2018 - "Captive Lion Breeding, Canned Lion Hunting & the Lion Bone Trade: Damaging Brand South Africa?"

Campaign Against Canned Hunting, Gaisford, B., 22 May 2020 – "African 'muti' and wildlife extinction"

Campaign to Ban Trophy Hunting (CBTH), 2019 – "<u>Trophy Hunting and Conservation – An assessment of evidence regarding impacts and benefits of sports hunting on wildlife and habitat conservation</u>"

Campaign to Ban Trophy Hunting (CBTH), May 2020 - "Shooting Captive Animals for Sport - South Africa, the United Kingdom & the growth of a global industry"

Challender, D.; Cooney, R., 2016 - "Informing decisions on trophy hunting: A Briefing Paper for European Union Decision-makers regarding potential plans for restriction of imports of hunting trophies," International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)

Coalition to Stop the Captive Breeding and Keeping of Lions and Other Big Cats for Commercial Purposes, 2019 – "Public Participation Submission of the Coalition to Stop the Captive Breeding and Keeping of Lions and Other Big Cats for Commercial Purposes - June 2019"

Congressional Research Service, 2019 – "International Trophy Hunting"

Conservation Action Trust, 18 June 2019 – "Leopard 2019 Leopard Trophy Hunting Quota -Wildlife Animal Protection Forum Submission," Wild Animal Protection Forum of South Africa (WAPFSA), Leopard Trophy Hunting Quota Submission 2019

Convention on International Trade in endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES), October 2018 - "Leopard Quota Review: South Africa (AC30, 15-A3)"

Creel, S.; M'soka J.; Dröge, E.; Rosenblatt E.; Becker, M.; Matandiko, W.; et al., 2016 – "Assessing the sustainability of African lion trophy hunting, with recommendations for policy," Ecological Applications

Cruise, A., 10 September 2023 "TROPHY HUNTING IS NEO-APARTHEID," African Elephant Journal/Conservation Action Trust

Daily Maverick, Op-Ed, 23 August 2022 - "South Africa's new environmental policy – a positive shift or a licence to kill?"

Daily Maverick, 18 May 2020 - "Horrific scale of SA's live wild animal trade to China exposed"

Daily Maverick, Op-Ed, 23 August 2022 - "South Africa's new environmental policy – a positive shift or a licence to kill?"

Daily Maverick, 31 August 2022 - "End trophy hunting in South Africa, or we won't visit your country, say tourists"

Daily Maverick, 29 November 2022 - "Political parties agree — captive lion breeding must end"

Daily Maverick, 12 September 2023 - "Balule trophy hunt — how not to shoot an elephant"

Daily Maverick, 26 September 2023 - "Conservationists appeal for end to hunting of elephants in private reserves bordering Kruger"

Deere, Nicolas J., July 2011 - "Exploitation or Conservation? Can The Hunting Tourism Industry in Africa Be Sustainable?" ResearchGate

Department: Environmental Affairs (DEA), Republic of South Africa, CBD, July 2015 - "South Africa's 2nd National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan 2015 – 2025"

De Waal, L., 1 June 2020 – "Conservation leaders urge UN World Tourism Organisation: Curb wildlife exploitation in 'tomorrow's tourism'," The South African



De Waal et al., African Journal of Wildlife Research 53: 21–28 (published 2 June 2023) - "Biting the hand that feeds you: Attacks by captive carnivores cause deaths and injuries in South Africa" - https://doi.org/10.3957/056.053.0021

DLA Piper, 15 May 2014 – "Empty Threat: Does the law combat illegal wildlife trade?"

Economists at Large, 2013 - "The \$200 million question: How much does trophy hunting really contribute to African communities?" a report for the African Lion Coalition, prepared by Economists at Large, Melbourne, Australia – International Wildlife Bond, 3 September 2015

Economists at Large, for Humane Society International, 2017 – "<u>The lion's share? On the economics benefits of trophy hunting</u>," Conservation Action Trust

Economic Research Southern Africa (ERSA), D. J. Crooks and J. N. Bilgnault, Journal for Nature Conservation, Elsevier, Pretoria, 2015 - "Debunking the myth that a legal trade will solve the rhino horn crisis: A system dynamics model for market demand"

EMS Foundation and Ban Animal Trading, 2018 - "The Extinction Business, South Africa's 'Lion' Bone Trade"

EMS Foundation and Ban Animal Trading, July 2018 - "The Extinction Business, South Africa's 'Lion' Bone Trade"

EMS Foundation, 10 October 2019 - "A BRIEFING PAPER TO INFORM DECISIONS PERTAINING TO TROPHY HUNTING IMPORT BANS"

EMS Foundation, via Cullinan & Associates attorneys, 15 April 2020 - The Honourable Ms Barbara Creecy, The Minister for Environment, Forestry and Fisheries - "Captive Lion and Other Big Cat Breeding Industry and Coronavirus"

EMS Foundation, 18 April 2020 - "EMS Foundation Appeals for Moratorium on the Lion Bone Industry"

EMS Foundation, 7 May 2020 – "Notice of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs on the Public Consultation: "National Catalogue of Animal Genetic Resources 2020-04-08, Seed Industry Management Department – Seed Division. Comments on two Draft Documents"

EMS Foundation, 17 May 2020 - "A SPECIAL REPORT BY: The EMS Foundation and The Ban Animal Trading Organisation"

EMS Foundation and Ban Animal Trading, 17 May 2020 - "Breaking Point: Uncovering South Africa's Shameful Live Wildlife Trade with China"

EMS Foundation and Ban Animal Trading, 22 May 2020 - "<u>OUTCOME OF THE MEETING BETWEEN BAN ANIMAL TRADING SOUTH AFRICA, THE EMS FOUNDATION AND THE MINISTER OF THE ENVIRONMENT, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES</u>"

Endangered Wildlife Trust (EWT) and Centre for Environmental Rights, 2018 – "Fair Game? Improving the well-being of South African wildlife"

Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), 2017 - "The Lion's Share"

Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), 8 November 2018 - "China's global push for traditional medicine must come with conditions for threatened wildlife"

Environmental Investigation Agency, August 2019 - "Stop the Slaughter - Close Domestic Rhino Horn Markets"

Environmental Investigation Agency, 7 May 2020 - "China's wildlife trade policy - where are we now and what might come next?"

Everatt, K. T.; Kokes R.; Pereira, C. L., 15 October 2019 - "Evidence of a further emerging threat to lion conservation; targeted poaching for body parts"

Fitzherbert, E; Caro, T.; Johnson, P.J.; Macdonald, D.W.; Borgerhoff Mulder, M., 2014 – "From avengers to hunters: Leveraging collective action for the conservation of endangered lions," Biological Conservation

Friedmann, Y; Traylor-Holzer, K. 2008 - "Leopard (Panthera Pardus) Case Study," NDF Workshop Case Study

Ginkel, A., 2016 - "Who's Actually Killing and 'Making a Killing' from Rhino?," International Wildlife Bond

Gonçalves, E., 2020 - "Trophy Hunters Exposed: Inside the big game industry," Green Future Books Ltd, London



Gunn, A.S., 2001 - "Environmental Ethics & Trophy Hunting," Ethics & the Environment, 6, 68-95

Harvey, R., 2018 - "The Economics of Captive Predator Breeding in South Africa" - South African Institute of International Affairs (SIIA)

Harvey, R., 20 September 2019 – "Trophy hunting is not sustainable," Ecologist, International Wildlife Bond

Harvey, R., 27 January 2020 - "UK must ban trophy hunting imports," Conservation Action Trust

Harvey, R., 23 April 2020 - "Wildlife trade: The unsustainability of 'sustainable use' (Part 1)"

Harvey, R. 23 April 2020 – "What is the wildlife trade? And what are the answers to managing it?" – Conservation Action Trust

Harvey, R., 30 April 2020 - "Why SA's courts place ecological sustainability ahead of government's reductionist sustainable use — Part 2,"
Daily Maverick

House Committee on Natural Resources, 2016 - "Missing the Mark - African trophy hunting fails to show consistent conservation benefits"

Hunter, L.T.; White, P.; Henschel, P.; Frank, L.; Burton, C.; Loveridge, A., et al., 2013 "Walking with lions: Why there is no role for captive-origin lions Panthera leo in species restoration," ORYX, 47, 19–24

International Monetary Fund, Chami, F., Fullenkamp, C., Cosimano, T. Berzaghi, F., September 2020, "THE SECRET WORK OF ELEPHANTS"

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)/PACO, 2009 - "Big Game Hunting in West Africa, What is its Contribution to Conservation?" ISBN: 978-2-8317-1204-8

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2016 [updated 2019] – "Informing decisions on trophy hunting: A Briefing Paper for European Union Decision-makers regarding potential plans for restriction of imports of hunting trophies," Roe, D.; Cremona, P.

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2016 – "<u>WCC-2016-Res-013-EN Terminating the hunting of captive-bred lions</u> (Panthera leo) and other predators and captive breeding for commercial, non-conservation purposes"

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2017 - "Sustainable use and trophy hunting: differences and IUCN positions"

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2019 - "Compatibility of Trophy Hunting as a Form of Sustainable Use with IUCN's Objectives" - This report has been provided by the following members of the World Commission on Environmental Law (WCEL) Ethics Specialist Group (ESG), Professors of environmental law: Bosselmann, K; Burdon, P; Taylor, P.; Stewart, N.; Kotzé, L.; Waikavee, T.

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2019b – "Africa is changing: Should its protected areas evolve? Reconfiguring the protected areas of Africa," Chardonnet, B

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 2019c – "<u>Development of a Roadmap for the Conservation of Leopards in Africa</u>," Version 1, Annex 4

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 2 September 2015 - "The economics of poaching, trophy and canned hunting"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 17 December 2015 - "Are lion trophy hunting quotas based on science?"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 5 January 2016 - "How can 'we' save the African lion, panthera leo?"

International Wildlife Bond, 29 February 2016 - "Rhino poaching in South Africa"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 7 March 2016 - "The 'Theatre' of Wildlife Decimation"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 16 March 2016 - "Trophy hunting and conservation"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 29 March 2016e - "9 Myths About Captive-bred Lions"



International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 8 July 2016 - "Canned duplicity and decline"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 22 July 2016 - ""A Case of Ethics" - How Can Trophy Hunting Be 'Acceptable?"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 3 October 2016 - "Another Missed Opportunity by CITES"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 8 February 2017 - "Leopard hunting in South Africa"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 30 November 2017 - "Open letter to Secretary Zinke: The African Lion Conservation Community's Response"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 28 August 2018 - "Giraffe being trophy hunted to supply United States Markets"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 7 August 2019 - "High Court Rules in Favour of Lions and NSPCA"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 21 October 2019 - "Animal Farm"

International Wildlife Bond, 28 January 2020 - "Government ignored its own science task team by redefining 32 wild species as farm animals"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 27 April 2020 - "<u>'Meat Safety Act, 2000 (Act No. 40 of 2000) - Proposed Update to Schedule 1, Section 1(2)</u>"

International Wildlife Bond (IWB), 29 May 2020 - "Trophy Hunting Exposed," Campaign to Ban Trophy Hunting

International Wildlife Bond, 11 June 2020 - "Submission to South Africa's High-Level Panel - elephant, lion, leopard and rhinoceros"

International Wildlife Bond, 2 March 2021 - "<u>Trophy Hunting - the heart of the matter</u>"

International Wildlife Bond, 26 July 2021 – "South Africa's Draft Policy Position - Elephant, Lion, Leopard and Rhinoceros"

International Wildlife Bond, 22 March 2022 - "Challenge to leopard hunting quota proof that the DFFE should change its spots"

International Wildlife Bond, 31 August 2022 - "Consultation on Conservation and Sustainable Use - South Africa," (White Paper)

International Wildlife Bond, 21 August 2023 - "Putting a stop to cruelty - Lion Bone Trade"

International Wildlife Bond, 11 September 2023 – "<u>Trophy Hunting: An Unnecessary Evil</u>"

Jacobson, A.P.; Gerngross, P.; Lemeris Jr., J.R.; Schoonover, R.F.; Anco, C.; Breitenmoser- Würsten, C.; Durant, S.M.; Farhadinia, M.S.; Henschel, P.; Kamler, J.F.; Laguardia, A.; Rostro-García, S.; Stein, A.B.; Dollar, L., 2016 - "Leopard (Panthera pardus) status, distribution, and the research efforts across its range," PeerJ

Jagged Peak Films, 2020 - "Lions, Bones & Bullets"

Kukura, J., 22 August 2022 – "Misinformation about disinformation in the trophy hunting debate," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J., 18 August 2022 – "When will sustainable use activists admit that trophy hunting is destructive?," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J., 2 August 2022 – "<u>Sustainable use activist and climate deniers teamed up to defend anti-environmental industries</u>," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J. 19 June 2022 "IUCN SULi is supporting a narrative-changing 'hunter advocacy' program," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J., 3 February 2020 - "The Trophy Hunting Industry's Ecological Time Bomb," Wild Things Initiative



Kukura, J., 1 April 2020 - "Theoretical Ecological Collapse: Any Excuse To Kill Elephants," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J., 2 April 2020 - "The Captive Lion Breeding Industry Puts Conservation And Public Health At Risk," Wild Things Initiative

Kukura, J. 29 April 2020 - "WHO STANDS TO BENEFIT, IF THE WILDLIFE TRADE CONTINUES?," EMS Foundation

Kukura, J., 18 May 2020 - "EXPOSED: ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE BOOMING THANKS TO LEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE"

Kukura, J., 1 June 2020 - "How American Hunting Organizations Conduct Information Warfare on Social Media"

Kukura, J., 17 January 2023 "Who's pulling the strings behind Africa's conservation narrative?"

Lindsey, P.A.; Roulet, P.A.; Romanch, S.S., 2006 – "<u>Economic and conservation significance of the trophy hunting industry in sub-Saharan Africa</u>," Biological Conservation

Lindsey, P.A.; Frank, L.G.; Alexander, R.; Mathieson, A; Romanach, S.S., 2007 – "<u>Trophy hunting and conservation in Africa: problems and one potential solution</u>," ResearchGate

Lindsey, P.A et al. 2008 - "Trophy Hunting in Sub Saharan Africa: Economic Scale and Conservation Significance"

Lindsey, P.; Balme, G.; Booth, V.; Midlane, N., 2012 - "The significance of African lions for the financial viability of trophy hunting and the maintenance of wild land," PLOS ONE

Lindsey, Peter Andrew; Balme, Guy Andrew; Funston, Paul; Henschel, Phillip; Hunter, Luke; Madzikanda, Hilary; Midlane, Neil; Nyirenda, Vincent, 2013a - "The Trophy Hunting of African Lions: Scale, Current Management Practices and Factors Undermining Sustainability," PLoS One

Lindsey, P.A.; Balme, G.; Becker, M.; Begg, C.; Bento, C.; Bocchino, C.; Dickman, A.; Diggle, R.W.; Eves, H.; Henschel, P.; Lewis, D.; Marnewick, K.; Mattheus, J.; McNutt, J.W.; McRobb, R.; Midlane, N.; Milanzi, J.; Morley, R.; Murphree, M.; Opyene, V.; Phadima, J.; Purchase, G.; Rentsch, D.; Roche, C.; Shaw, J.; Van der Westhuizen, H.; Van Vliet, N.; Zisadza-Gandiwa, P., 2013b – "<u>The bushmeat trade in African savannas: Impacts, drivers, and possible solutions,</u>" Biological Conservation 160: 80-96.

Lindsey, P.A.; Petraccaac, L.S.; Funston, P.J.; Bauer, H.; Dickman, A.; Everatte, K.; Flyman, M.; Henschel, P.; Hinks, A.E.; Kasikig, S.; Loveridge, A.; Macdonal, D.W.; Mandisodzah, R.; Mgoolai, W.; Miller, S.M.; Nazeralil, S.; Siegem, L.; Uisebn, K.; Hunter, L.B.T., 2017 - "The performance of African protected areas for lions and their prey," Science Direct

Loveridge, A.; Reynolds, J.C.; Milner-Gulland, E.J., 2006 - "Does sport hunting benefit conservation?"

Loveridge, A.; Searle, A.; Murindagomo, F.; Macdonald, D., 2007 – "The impact of sport-hunting on the population dynamics of an African lion population in a protected area," Biological Conservation

Loveridge A.J., Packer C. & Dutton A. (2009) – Dickinson B., Hutton J. & Adams W.M. (Eds.), "Recreational Hunting, Conservation and Rural Livelihoods: Science and Practice," Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell Press, p 108 – 124.

Loveridge, A., 2018 - "Lion Hearted - The Life and Death of Cecil & The Future of Africa's Iconic Cats," econISBN 978-168245120-5

Mail & Guardian, 23 October 1998 – "How the lid was lifted on canned lions"

Martin, R. B.; De Meulenaer, T., 1988 – "Survey of the Status and Distribution of Leopard in Sub-Saharan Africa [Google Scholar]," Convention on the International Trade of Endangered Species Secretariat, Lausanne, Switzerland

Milner, J. M. et al., 2007 - "<u>Demographic Side Effects of Selective Hunting in Unqulates and Carnivores</u>," Conservation Biology, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 36-47

Mweetwa, T.; Christianson, D.; Becker, M.; Creel, S.; Rosenblatt, E.; Merkle, J.; Dröge, E.; Mwape, H.; Masonde, J. and Simpamba, T, May 2018 – "Quantifying lion (Panthera leo) demographic response following a three-year moratorium on trophy hunting," PlosOne



National Geographic, 24 September 2019 - "How much is a whale worth?"

National Geographic, 17 November 2015 - "Is Trophy Hunting Helping Save African Elephants?"

National Geographic, 11 March 2016 - "The End of 'Canned' Lion Hunting May Be in Sight"

National Geographic, October 2017 – "Trophy Hunting: Should We Kill Animals to Save Them? - Trophy hunting fees help fund conservation. Critics say the benefits are exaggerated and that killing big game animals is wrong"

National Geographic, 21 November 2019 - "Exclusive: Inside a controversial South African lion farm"

National Geographic, 7 May 2020 - "To prevent the next pandemic, it's the legal wildlife trade we should worry about"

National Council - Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (NSPCA), South Africa, 13 May 2020 – "Captive lions in deplorable condition"

Nature Neds More, 27 April 2023 - "What Are John Hume's Rhinos Really Worth?"

Naude, V.N.; Balme, G.A.; O'Riain, J.; Hunter, L.T.B.; Fattebert, J.; Dickerson, T.; Bishop, J.M., 18 March 2020 - "<u>Unsustainable anthropogenic mortality disrupts natal dispersal and promotes inbreeding in leopards</u>"

Nikiforuk, A., 19 May 2019 – "Who, or What, Will Stop the Battle against Biodiversity? - Environmentalism has failed to halt the relentless 'furnace' of humanity"

Nowak, Katarzyna, Lee, Phyllis C., Marino, Jorgelina, Mkono, Mucha, Mumby, Hannah, Dobson, Andrew, Harvey, Ross, Lindsay, Keith, Lusseau, David, Sillero-Zubiri, Claudio, 71 signatories, 2019 - "Trophy hunting: Bans create opening for change"

OCCRP, 26 October 2022 - "Inside South Africa's Brutal Lion Bone Trade"

Oxford University, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit (WildCRU), Macdonald, Professor David et al., 2016 – "Report on Lion Conservation with Particular Respect to the Issue of Trophy Hunting," International Wildlife Bond

Packer. C; Kosmala, M.; Cooley, H.S.; Brink, H.; Pintea, L.; Garshelis, D. et al., 2009 - "Sport hunting, predator control and conservation of large carnivores," PLoS ONE

Packer C.; Brink H.; Kissui, B.M.; Maliti H.; Kushnir, H.; Caro, T., 2011 - "Effects of trophy hunting on lion and leopard populations in Tanzania," Conservation Biology

Packer, C.; Loveridge, A.; Canney, S.; Caro, T.; Garnett, S.T.; Pfeifer, M.; Zander, K.K.; Swanson, A.; MacNulty, D.; Balme, G.; Bauer, H.; Begg, C.M.; Begg, K.S.; Bhalla, S.; Bissett, C.; Bodasing, T.; Brink, H.; Burger, A.; Burton, A.C.; Clegg, B.; Dell, S.; Delsink, D.; Dickerson, T.; Dloniak, S.M.; Druce, D.; Frank, L.; Funston, P.; Gichohi, N.; Groom, R.; Hanekom, C.; Heath, B.; Hunter, L.; Delongh, H.H.; Joubert, C.J.; Kasiki, S,M.; Kissui, B.; Knocker, W.; Leathem, B.; Lindsey, P.A.; Maclennan, S.D.; McNutt, J.W.; Miller, S.M.; Naylor, S.; Nel, P.; Ng'weno, C.; Nicholls, K.; Ogutu, J.O.; Okot-Omoya, E.; Patterson, B.D.; Plumptre, A.; Salerno, J.; Skinner, K.; Slotow, R.; Sogbohossou, E.A.; Stratford, K.J.; Winterbach, C.; Winterbach H.; Polasky, S., 2013 – "Conserving large carnivores: dollars and fences," Wiley Online Library

Packer, C. - "Lions in the Balance," 2015, ISBN-13: 978-0-226-09295-9

Panthera, July 2018 - "A SCIENTIFIC OVERVIEW OF THE CONSERVATION STATUS OF AFRICAN LEOPARDS (PANTHERA PARDUS PARDUS), WITH A SPECIFIC FOCUS ON TROPHY HUNTING" CITES AC30 Inf. 23

Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Environmental Affairs (PPCEA), 13 November 2018 – "Portfolio Committee on Environmental Affairs on the Colloquium on Captive Lion Breeding for Hunting in South Africa: harming or promoting the conservation image of the country, held on 21 and 22 august 2018, dated 8 November 2018"

Patterson, G., 1998 - "Dying to be free"

Paquet, P.; Darimont, C., 2010 - "Wildlife conservation and animal welfare: Two sides of the same coin?," Researchgate



Peirce, R., 2018 "Cuddle me, kill me,"

Peters, A. (Editor), 2020 - "<u>Studies in Global Animal Law</u>," Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Springer - https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-662-60756-5

Pinnock, D., 23 April 2018 - "Tigers are being bred in Gauteng backyards for petting and bone export," Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 19 July 2018 - "Dodgy skeleton traders and lion slaughterhouses exposed in damning report" - Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 25 April 2019 – "Trophy hunting, part one: The nasty colonial sport of shooting wild animals" - Daily Maverick, International Wildlife Bond

Pinnock, D., 30 April 2019 – "Trophy hunting part two: End-of-the-game" – Daily Maverick, International Wildlife Bond

Pinnock, D., 16 October 2019 - "By the stroke of a legislative pen, a list of iconic and in some cases endangered wild animals can now be manipulated as farming stock. What happens next is anyone's guess," Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 28 January 2020 – "Government ignored its own science task team by redefining 32 wild species as farm animals" Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 25 August 2022 – "Killing for the House of Jesus — church trophy hunt raises a storm," Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 17 January 2023 - "Bones of contention – fate of thousands of captive lions in SA depends on implementation of government report findings - Special Report," Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 25 January 2023 - "Grisly report on captive lions shocks Parliament," Daily Maverick

Pinnock, D., 26 September 2023 – "Government opens public comments on policy to end captive lion breeding," Daily Maverick

Pitman, R.T.; Fattebert, J.; Williams, S.T.; Williams, K.S.; Hill, R.A.; Hunter, L.T.B.; Slotow, R.; Balme, G.A., 26 June 2016 - "<u>The Conservation Costs of Game Ranchina</u>," Society for Conservation Biology

Peirce, Richard, 2018 – "Cuddle Me, Kill Me," ISBN 978-1-77584-593-5

Rademeyer, J., 2016 - "Tipping Point – Transnational organised crime and the 'war' on poaching

Republic of South Africa - Meat safety Act, 2000 (Act 40 of 2000)

Republic of South Africa - <u>Animal Disease Act 35 of 1984</u>

Republic of South Africa - "Controllable and Notifiable Animal Disease," Department: Agriculture, Food and Fisheries (DAFF)

Republic of South Africa - Animal Health Act 2002 (No. 7 of 2002)

Republic of South Africa - Foodstuffs, Cosmetics and Disinfectants Act, 1972 (Act 52 of 1972)

Republic of South Africa - Animal Improvement Act (AIA,) 1998

Republic of South Africa - National Environmental Management Biodiversity Act (NEMBA), 2004

Republic of South Africa - National Environmental Management Laws Amendment Bill (NEMLAB)

Republic of South Africa - Threatened or Protected Species Regulations as amended, Notice 388 of 2013, Gazette 36375, 16 April 2013

Republic of South Africa, 29 November 2010 - "The Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa Judgement - Case No. 72/10"

Republic of South Africa, Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA) - "Lion Management in South Africa"

Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs (DEA), 2014 - "The viability of legalising trade in rhino horn in South Africa"



Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs - "2nd National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan 2015 - 2025"

Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs - "AFRICAN RHINO RANGE STATES' AFRICAN RHINO CONSERVATION PLAN,"
April 2016

Republic of South Africa, Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA), 16 January 2017 - "Department of Environmental Affairs confirms extension of zero quota for leopard hunting in South Africa"

Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs (DEA), Gazette Notice 40601, Vol. 620, 8 February 2017 - "Notice 74 - Domestic Trade in Rhinoceros Horn, or Part, Product or Derivative of Rhinoceros Horn"

Republic of South Africa, Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA), 28 June 2017 – "<u>Lion export quota for 2017 communicated to the CITES Secretariat in line with CITES requirements</u>"

Republic of South Africa, Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA), September 2018 - "Leopard Quota Review: South Africa" (AC30 Doc 15. Annex 3)

Republic of South Africa, High Court of South Africa (Gauteng Division, Johannesburg), 13 September 2018 - "Case 86515/17"

Republic of South Africa, Minister for Environment Affairs and Tourism - "Assessment of South African Elephant Management - Summary for Policy Makers

Republic of South Africa, 13 November 2018 – "Report of the Portfolio Committee on Environmental Affairs on the Colloquium on Captive Lion Breeding for Hunting in South Africa: harming or promoting the conservation image of the country, held on 21 and 22 august 2018, dated 8 November 2018"

Republic of South Africa, 17 May 2019 - "Additional Lists to Table 7, Animal Improvements Act (AIA), 1998," Notice 664, Gazette 42464

Republic of South Africa, High Court of South Africa (Gauteng Division, Johannesburg), 6 August 2019 - "Judgement - Case 86515/17"

Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affair, 22 August 2019 - "Non-detriment findings for Ceratotherium simum (white rhinoceros) - Consultation in Terms of Section 62(3) of the National Environmental Management: Biodiversity Act, 2004 (Act No. 10 of 2004)," Notice 1105, Gazette 42660, Vol. 650

Republic of South Africa, Department: Environmental Affairs (DEA), 22 April 2020 "HLP Terms of Reference"

Republic of South Africa, Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment (DFFE), 28 June 2021 - "<u>Draft policy position on the conservation and ecologically Sustainable Use of elephant, lion, leopard and rhinoceros</u>" - Government Gazette 44776, Vol. 672, Notice 566 of 2021

Republic of South Africa, Department: Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment, 8 July 2022 - "South Africa's Biodiversity 2022: Consultation on the Draft White Paper on Conservation and Sustainable Use" — Government Gazette 46687, vol. 685, Notice 2252 of 2022

Republic of South Africa, Department: Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment, Gazette 47024, Notice 2293 of 2022, 18 July 2022b, "Game Meat Strategy for South Africa, 2022: Consultation on Draft"

Republic of South Africa, Department: Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment, 14 June 2023 - "White Paper on Conservation and Sustainable Use of South Africa's Biodiversity" - Government Gazette 4878, Notice 3537 of 2023

Riggio, J.; Jacobson, A.; Dollar, L.; Bauer, H.; Becker, M.; Dickman, A. et al., 2012 - "The size of savannah Africa: a lion's (Panthera leo) view," Biodiversity and Conservation

Roe, D.; Cremona, P., 2016 – "Informing decisions on trophy hunting: A Briefing Paper for European Union Decision-makers regarding potential plans for restriction of imports of hunting trophies," IUCN

Rosenblatt, E.; Becker, M. S.; Creel, S.; Droge, E.; Mweetwa, T.; Schuette, P. A.; Watson, F.; Merkle, J.; Mwape, H., 2014 – "<u>Detecting declines of apex carnivores and evaluating their causes: An example with Zambian lions</u>," Biological Conservation 180: 176-186.



Scully, M., 2011 - "Dominion: The Power of Man, the Suffering of Animals, and the Call to Mercy," ISBN 9780285639041, Souvenir Press Ltd.

Selier, S.A.G., Di Minin, E., 2015 - "Monitoring for Effective Sustainable Use of Wildlife," Animal Conservation, vol. 18 (2015), pp. 131-132.

Selier, J.; Blackmore, A.; Coverdale, B.; Kruger, J.; Mulqueeny, C.; Nel, L., August 2018 - "An assessment of the potential risks of the practice of intensive and selective breeding of game to biodiversity and the economy in South Africa"

Skye Report, 2018 - "The Controversial lion Hunt in Umbabat - South Africa"

Smithsonian Magazine, January/February 2023 - "Is It Ethical to Hunt Captive Lions?"

Sowry, R., - "Greater KNP hunting protocol for reserves where hunting takes place," Conservation Action Trust

Stoddard, E., 11 May 2020a - "South African game-farming industry on the 'brink of collapse'," Business Maverck

Strampelli, P.; Henschel, P.; Searle, C.E; Macdonald, D.W.; Dickman, A.J., 23 May 2022, "Habitat use of and threats to African large carnivores in a mixed-use landscape," Conservation Biology, https://doi.org/10.1111/cobi.13943

Sunday Times (South Africa), 24 May 2020 - "Enabling Dealers in Death - SA's international wildlife trade 'poorly enforced, indefensible and shameful' - report"

Swanepoel, L.; Lindsey, P.; Somers, M.J.; Van Hoven, W.; Dalerum, F., 2014 - "<u>The relative importance of trophy harvest and retaliatory killing of large carnivores: South African leopards as a case study,</u>" South African Journal of Wildlife Research, pp. 115 - 134, 2014.

The African Lion Conservation Community, 2017 - "Open letter to Secretary Zinke: The African Lion Conservation Community's response to the South African Predator Association's letter"

The Conversation, 15 November 2018 - "Counting the contribution of hunting to South Africa's economy,"

The Conversation, 30 July 2019 - "Captive lion breeding in South Africa: the case for a total ban"

The Conversation, 14 November 2019 - "South Africa struggles to manage wildlife ranching: why it's a problem"

The Conversation, 10 August 2023 - "Lion farming in South Africa: fresh evidence adds weight to fears of link with illegal bone trade"

The Express, 12 May 2020 - "Coronavirus: Why South Africa's breeding farms could be 'petri dish' for next pandemic"

The Express, 29 May 2020 - "Outrage as South Africa law change could put elephants and giraffes on dinner table"

The Guardian, 29 January 2020 - "South Africa: wild animals at risk of 'genetic pollution'"

The Guardian, 5 July 2022 – "Promised land: how South Africa's black farmers were set up to fail"

The Independent, 9 July 2019 – "Lions and tigers suffer painful deformities in industrial breeding schemes for traditional Chinese 'medicine'"

The Independent, 17 May 2020 – "South Africa traffics thousands of endangered wild animals to China in 'corrupt and growing' trade, investigation finds"

The Independent, 2 June 2020 - "Confront illegal wildlife trafficking with international criminal laws, former global trade chief says"

The independent, 3 June 2020 - "Stop the Wildlife Trade: Appeal to Boris Johnson to lead G20 drive for worldwide ban"

The Metro, 28 April 2019 - "Thousands of lions bred in farms to be shot by hunters and killed for 'medicine'"

The Southern Africa Tourism Services Association (SATSA), 2019 - "Evaluating Captive Wildlife Attractions & Activities"

The World Bank, 6 June 2020 – "Concept Environmental and Social Review Summary Concept Stage - South Africa: Wildlife Conservation Bond (P174097)"



TRAFFIC; WildCRU, 2015 - "Bones of Contention: An assessment of South African trade in African lion bone and other body parts"

Treves, A.; Santiago-Ávila, F.J.; Popescu, V.D.; Paquet, P.C.; Lynn, W.S.; Darimont, C.T.; Artelle, K.A., 25 October 2019 - "Trophy hunting: Insufficient evidence," Science, Vol. 366, Issue 6464

University of Cape Town, 11 May 2020 - "Exploited leopards pay long-term inbreeding costs"

Waal, L., 25 June 2019 - "South Africa selling tiger and lion hunts to Chinese nouveau riche," Conservation Action Trust

Whitman, K.; Starflield, M.; Quadling, S.; Packer, C., 2004 – "Sustainable trophy hunting of African Lions," Nature

Williams, S.T.; Williams, K.S.; Lewis, B.P.; Hill, R.A., 2017 – "Population dynamics and threats to an apex predator outside protected areas: implications for carnivore management," Royal Society Open Science

Williams, V.L.; Loveridge, A.J.; Newton, D.J.; Macdonald, D.W, 2017 – "<u>A roaring trade? The legal trade in Panthera leo bones from Africa to East-Southeast Asia</u>"

Williams, V. L.; Sas-Rolfes, M. J., 2019, "Born captive: A survey of the lion breeding, keeping and hunting industries in South Africa," PLoS ONE

Winkler, H.S. MP – DA Deputy Shadow Minister Environmental Affairs, Forestry and Fisheries, 25 May 2020 - "Didiza's attempt to legalise the consumption of wild animals is unfathomable"

World Animal Protection, 9 July 2019 – "Lions and tigers being farmed for bone wine and other traditional medicine"

World Animal Protection, Open letter to the United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) and their Global Tourism Crisis Committee, 1 June 2020 – "A call to phase out captive wildlife entertainment in tourism as an essential element of 'growing back better' and preparing for tomorrow's responsible and sustainable tourism"

World Animal Protection, August 2022 - "Trophy hunting puts South Africa's tourism industry in peril"

World Animal Protection, July 2023 - "Putting a stop to cruelty: why South Africa's commercial captive lion industry should be shut down for qood"

World Health Organisation (WHO), 1 December 2021, "<u>Tripartite and UNEP support OHHLEP's definition of "One Health"</u>," Joint Tripartite (FAO, OIE, WHO) and UNEP Statement – <u>One Health High Level Expert Panel (OHHLEP)</u>